

Introduction To Variational Relations : D. T. Liu

Lecture 1 :

10.5.2010

I. Projection :

H : Hilbert space

$K \subseteq H$ be a closed convex set

Hilbert Projection Theorem :

$\forall a \in H \exists$ a unique $\bar{x} \in K$ such that

$$\|a - \bar{x}\| \leq \|a - x\| \quad \forall x \in K$$

In the form of variational inequality (VI) :

$$1) \quad \bar{x} = \text{proj}_K a \iff \langle \bar{x} - a, x - \bar{x} \rangle \geq 0 \quad \forall x \in K \quad (1)$$

Refine $F: H \rightarrow H$ as

$$F(x) = x - a$$

Then (1) becomes finding $\bar{x} \in K$ such that

$$\langle F(\bar{x}), x - \bar{x} \rangle \geq 0 \quad \forall x \in K$$

This is nothing but VI.

Consider the problem : $\min_{x \in K} f(x)$

By optimality condition at the point of minima $\bar{x} \in K$, we have,

$$- \nabla f(\bar{x}) \in N_K(\bar{x}) \quad \text{ie } \langle \nabla f(\bar{x}), x - \bar{x} \rangle \geq 0 \quad \forall x \in K$$

which is a VI with $F = \nabla f$.

$(N_K(\bar{x}) = \text{normal cone to set } K \text{ at } \bar{x})$

$$= \{ x^* \in H' : \langle x^*, x - \bar{x} \rangle \leq 0 \quad \forall x \in K \}$$

Hilbert Projection Theorem

\Rightarrow Riesz Representation Theorem :

$\forall \phi \in H'$ \exists a unique $a \in H$ such that

$$\phi(x) = \langle a, x \rangle \quad \forall x \in H$$

⇒ Stampacchia's Theorem:

$A(u, v)$: bilinear form, continuous, coercive
 $K \subseteq H$ nonempty closed convex and $\forall \psi \in H' \exists$ a
unique $\bar{u} \in K$ such that

$$A(\bar{u}, v - \bar{u}) - \psi(v - \bar{u}) \geq 0 \quad \forall v \in K.$$

II Generalizations

- $VI(K, F)$: Find $\bar{x} \in K$ such that
 $\langle F\bar{x}, x - \bar{x} \rangle \geq 0 \quad \forall x \in K$

As discussed the optimality condition for differentiable function f , if f is nonsmooth the optimality condition now becomes

$$0 \in \partial f(\bar{x}) + N_K(\bar{x})$$

ie, there exists $\bar{y} \in \partial f(\bar{x})$ such that

$$\langle \bar{y}, x - \bar{x} \rangle \geq 0 \quad \forall x \in K.$$

Therefore, for a set-valued mapping F , $VI(K, F)$ is:
Find $\bar{x} \in K$ such that

$$\langle \bar{y}, x - \bar{x} \rangle \geq 0 \quad \forall x \in K, \quad \forall \bar{y} \in F(\bar{x}).$$

- Mixed VI: $\langle F(\bar{x}), x - \bar{x} \rangle + h(x) - h(\bar{x}) \geq 0 \quad \forall x \in K$

- Generalized VI: $\langle F(\bar{x}), g(x) - g(\bar{x}) \rangle + h(x) - h(\bar{x}) \geq 0 \quad \forall x \in K$

- Equilibrium problem: $\psi(x, \bar{x}) \geq 0 \quad \forall x \in K$

- Set-valued variational inclusion:

For set-valued maps F, G , find $\bar{x} \in K$ such that

$$F(\bar{x}, x) \subseteq G(\bar{x}, x) \quad \forall x \in K.$$

Inclusion may be replaced by empty / nonempty inclusion.

III. Abstract Models:

A, B, C are nonempty sets

consider set-valued maps: $S: A \rightrightarrows B$

$T_1: A \rightrightarrows B$

$T_2: A \times B \rightrightarrows C$

R : relation linking $a \in A, b \in B, c \in C$

\therefore Variational Relation (VR) is:

Find $\bar{a} \in A$ such that

- $\bar{a} \in S(\bar{a})$

- $R(\bar{a}, b, c)$ holds $\forall b \in T_1(\bar{a})$

$$\forall c \in T_2(\bar{a}, b) \equiv c \in \bigcup_{b \in T_1(\bar{a})} T_2(\bar{a}, b)$$

eg 1: $A = B = C = X$ (any given set)

$$S(x) = \{y \in X : g_i(y) \leq 0, i \in I, h_j(y) = 0, j \in J\}$$

$$= S \text{ (independent of } x)$$

$$T_1(x) = S(x) = S$$

$$T_2(x, y) = \{y\}$$

$$R(x, y, z) \text{ holds} \Leftrightarrow f(z) - f(x) \geq 0 \text{ where } f: X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$$

\therefore (VR) is:

Find $\bar{x} \in X$ such that

- $\bar{x} \in S(\bar{x}) = S$ i.e. \bar{x} is feasible

- $R(\bar{x}, y, z)$ holds $\forall y \in T_1(\bar{x}) = S$ i.e. y is feasible

$$\forall z \in T_2(\bar{x}, y) = \{y\} \text{ i.e. } z = y$$

$$\Rightarrow f(y) = f(\bar{x}) \geq 0 \quad \forall y \in S \text{ (Optimality)}$$

eg 2: $A = B = C = X$

$$S(x) = X, T_1(x) = X, T_2(x, y) = \{y\}$$

$$R(x, y, z) \text{ holds} \Leftrightarrow \psi(z, z) \geq 0 \text{ where } \psi: X \times X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$$

\therefore (VR) \equiv Find $\bar{x} \in X$ such that

$$\psi(\bar{x}, y) \geq 0 \quad \forall y \in X$$

eg 3: $A = B = C = K$

$$S(x) = K, \quad T_1(x) = K, \quad T_2(x, y) = \sum y_j$$

$$R(x, y, z) \text{ holds} \Leftrightarrow \langle F(x), z - x \rangle + h(x) - h(x) \geq 0$$

\therefore (VCR) \equiv Find $\bar{x} \in K$ such that

$$\langle F(\bar{x}), y - \bar{x} \rangle + h(y) - h(\bar{x}) \geq 0 \quad \forall y \in K$$

(Mixed VI).

IV Existence:

Assume S, T_1, T_2 have nonempty values.

Criterion 1: \bar{a} is a solution $\Leftrightarrow \bar{a} \in \bigcap_{b \in B} P(b)$

where

$$P(b) = \{A \setminus T_1^{-1}(b)\} \cup \{a \in A : a \in S(a),$$

$$R(a, b, c) \text{ holds} \quad \forall c \in T_2(a, b)\}$$

Criterion 2: \bar{a} is a solution $\Leftrightarrow B \setminus P^{-1}(a) = \emptyset$

In particular, if $A = B$, then (VCR) has a solution under the following conditions:

$a \mapsto A \setminus P^{-1}(a)$ has a fixed point if it is non-empty valued $\forall a$

$$T_j(a) \subseteq S(a)$$

) $R(a, a, c)$ holds $\forall c \in T_2(a, a)$ if $a \in S(a)$.

Particular case (KKM relations): (Here $A = B$)

R is KKM if $\forall a_1, a_2, \dots, a_k \in A$,

$$\forall a \in \text{co}\{a_1, a_2, \dots, a_k\},$$

$\exists i$ such that

$$R(a, a_i, c) \text{ holds} \quad \forall c \in T_2(a, a_i)$$

Thm' (Sufficient condition) Assume:

- (i) $A = B$ non empty convex compact
- (ii) P has closed values
- (iii) $co(T, Ca) \subseteq S(Ca) \forall a \in A$
- (iv) R is KKM

Then (VPR) has a solution.

Lecture 2

11.5.2010

R is a relation on $A \times B \times C$ defined as:

- $\phi(a, b, c) \geq 0$ where $\phi: A \times B \times C \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ (inequality)
- $F(a, b, c) \subseteq G(a, b, c)$ (inclusion)

eg: Let $T: X \rightrightarrows Y$, $\phi: K \times Y \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ (coupling function)
 $K \subseteq X$

The problem may be formulated as:

Find $\bar{x} \in K$ such that

$$\phi(y - \bar{x}, \xi) \geq 0 \quad \forall \xi \in T(\bar{x}), \quad \forall \xi \in K$$

$$\text{If } Y = X', \quad \phi(x, \xi) = \xi(x) \quad \forall \xi \in X', \quad x \in X$$

$$\text{If } X = H, \quad Y = X' = H, \quad \phi(x, \xi) = \langle \xi, x \rangle.$$

eg: (Four KKM relation)

Find $\bar{x} \in K \subseteq X$ such that

$$x^*(y - \bar{x}) \geq 0 \quad \forall y \in K, \quad \forall x^* \in T(\bar{x}) \quad \text{where } T: X \rightrightarrows X'$$

Its (VPR) form is:

$$A = B = K, \quad C = X'$$

$$S(x) = K, \quad T(x) = K, \quad T_2(x, y) = T(x)$$

$$R(x, y, \xi) \text{ holds} \Leftrightarrow \xi(y - x) \geq 0.$$

Monotonicity:

i) Monotone: $y^*(y=x) + x^*(x-y) \geq 0 \quad \forall x^* \in T(x), \forall y^* \in T(y)$

ii) Quasimonotone: $\max_i \{ x^*(y-x), y^*(x-y) \} \geq 0$

iii) Pseudomonotone: $x^*(y-x) \geq 0$ for some $x^* \in T(x)$

$$\Rightarrow y^*(y-x) \geq 0 \quad \forall y^* \in T(y)$$

iv) Proper quasimonotone: $\forall x_1, \dots, x_k \in K$

$$\forall x \in \text{co} \{ x_1, \dots, x_k \},$$

there exist i such that

$$x^*(x_i - x) \geq 0 \quad \forall x^* \in T(x_i)$$

(i) \Rightarrow (iii) \Rightarrow (iv) $\Leftrightarrow R$ is KKM.

Finite Solvability:

VR model and finite solvability:

(CVR) \equiv Find $\bar{a} \in A$ such that

1. $\bar{a} \in S(\bar{a})$

2. $R(\bar{a}, b, c)$ holds $\forall b \in T, \bar{c} \in A$

$$\forall c \in T_2(C\bar{a}, b)$$

Criterion 1: \bar{a} is a solution $\Leftrightarrow \bar{a} \in \bigcap_{b \in B} P(b)$

Def: (CVR) is finitely solvable if for every finite subset

$D \subseteq B$, there exists $a_0 \in A$ such that

$$\forall b \in D \text{ either } b \notin T, (a_0) \text{ or } \left. \begin{array}{l} a_0 \in S(a_0) \\ R(a_0, b, c) \text{ holds} \\ \forall c \in T_2(a_0, b) \end{array} \right\}$$

(trivial).

Solvability of CVR \Rightarrow Finite solvability \Leftarrow Need additional cond'seg: (For FS) min $f(x)$ subject to $g_i(x) \leq 0$, $i \in I$ $h_j(x) = 0$, $j \in J$ $x \in X$ CVR $\equiv A = B = C = X$ $S(x) = S$ (feasible set) (independent of x) $T_1(x) = S$ $T_2(x, y) = \{y\}$ $R(x, y, \lambda)$ holds $\Leftrightarrow f(x) - f(x) \geq 0$ (FS): $y_1, \dots, y_k \in X$, $\exists a_0 \in X$ such thateither $y_i \notin T_1(a_0) = S$ i.e. y_i is not feasibleor $\{a_0 \in S(a_0) = S$ i.e. a_0 is feasible and $f(y_i) - f(a_0) \geq 0$.

In this example, (FS) holds.

II. Intersectional closedness:Let $F: \Lambda \rightarrow X$ $\bigcap_{\lambda \in \Lambda} \text{cl}(F(\lambda)) \neq \emptyset \Rightarrow \bigcap_{\lambda \in \Lambda} F(\lambda) \neq \emptyset$ Def: F is intersectionally closed if $\bigcap_{\lambda \in \Lambda} \text{cl}(F(\lambda)) = \text{cl} \bigcap_{\lambda \in \Lambda} F(\lambda)$ eg: $C_i \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n$ be nonempty convex. By Rockafellar (1970), if $\bigcap_{i \in I} C_i \neq \emptyset$, then $\bigcap_{i \in I} \text{cl} C_i = \text{cl} \bigcap_{i \in I} C_i$

g) $f_i: \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R} \cup \{+\infty\}$ convex functions

$$\bigcap_{i \in I} \text{cl}(\text{epi } f_i) = \text{cl} \bigcap_{i \in I} \text{epi } f_i = \text{cl} \text{epi} \left(\sup_{i \in I} f_i \right)$$

$$= \text{epi} \left(\sup_{i \in I} \text{cl } f_i \right)$$

[$\text{cl } f$: lsc hull of f . $\text{epi}(\text{cl } f) = \text{cl} \text{epi } f$]

Sufficient Conditions for I.C :

$F(\lambda)$ is closed $\forall \lambda$

$F(\cdot)$ is outer continuous i.e.,

$$\limsup_{\lambda \rightarrow \lambda_0} F(\lambda) \subseteq F(\lambda_0) \quad \forall \lambda_0 \in \Lambda$$

$\limsup_{\lambda \rightarrow \lambda_0} F(\lambda) = \{ x \in X ; \exists \lambda_n \rightarrow \lambda_0, x_n \in F(\lambda_n) \text{ such that } x_n \rightarrow x \}$

$F(\cdot)$ is transfer closed, i.e.

$$\bigcap_{\lambda \in \Lambda} \text{cl } F(\lambda) = \bigcap_{\lambda \in \Lambda} F(\lambda)$$

Particular case :

$$F: \Lambda \rightarrow X$$

$F(\lambda) = \{ x \in X ; \psi(\lambda, x) \leq 0 \}$ where $\psi: \Lambda \times X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$

$$\bigcap_{\lambda \in \Lambda} F(\lambda) = \{ x \in X ; \psi(\lambda, x) \leq 0 \quad \forall \lambda \in \Lambda \}$$

Sufficient conditions :

i) $\phi(\lambda, \cdot)$ is lsc in $x \Rightarrow$ level set of $\phi(\lambda, \cdot)$ is closed

$$\Rightarrow \bigcap " " " " " " "$$

i) $\phi(\lambda, \cdot)$ is transfer closed in x

(i.e. if $\phi(\lambda, x) > 0$ for some λ , x

$\Rightarrow \exists \lambda' \in \Lambda$, a neighbourhood of x , $N(x)$ such that

$$\phi(\lambda', x') > 0 \quad \forall x' \in N(x)$$

If ϕ is continuous in x , then holds true for $\lambda = \lambda'$)

(iii) $\forall \bar{x} \in X$, $\sup \phi(\lambda, x) > 0 \quad \forall x$ close to \bar{x} , then
 $\exists \lambda' \in \Lambda$ and a neighborhood of \bar{x} , $N(\bar{x})$ such
 that $\phi(\lambda', x') > 0 \quad \forall x' \in N(\bar{x})$.

III. FS Principle:

Def: A is compact.

R is IC (i.e. the map $b \mapsto P(b)$ is IC).

(CVR) is solvable \Leftrightarrow it is finitely solvable.

Pf: (\Rightarrow) Trivial.

(\Leftarrow) Apply finite intersection property.

Def: Finite Intersection Property (F.I.P).

consider the family $\{A_i : i \in I\}$

$\bigcap_{i \in I} A_i \neq \emptyset \Rightarrow \bigcap_{i \in I} A_i \neq \emptyset$.

Applications:

Lecture 3

13.5.2010

Weierstrass Thm:

consider the problem (\bar{P})

$\min f(x)$

st $g_i(x) \leq 0, i \in I$

$h_j(x) = 0, j \in J$

(CVR) form: $A = B = C = X$

$S(x) = S$ (feasible set)

$T_1(x) = S$

$T_2(x, y) = \{y\}$

$R(x, y, z)$ holds $\Leftrightarrow f(x) - f(x) \geq 0$.

Here, (CVR) is finitely solvable.

\Rightarrow Problem (\bar{P}) is solvable if (IC) is satisfied.

(i.e. $b \mapsto P(b)$ is IC).

No. _____

Date _____

$P: B \rightarrow A$ where $P(b) = (A \setminus T^{-1}(b))$

$\cup \{x \in X : x \in S(x)\}$,

$$f(b) - f(x) \geq 0 \}$$

(IC) holds $\Leftrightarrow x \mapsto \{y \in X : y \text{ is feasible}\}$,

$$f(x) - f(y) \geq 0 \} \text{ is (IC)}$$

According to Weierstrass Thm:

If X is compact and $f: X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ is lsc, then f has a minimum in X .

Def: f is IC if $\forall x_0 \in X$, \exists a neighbourhood of x_0 , $N(x_0)$, such that $\forall x \in N(x_0) \exists \alpha > \inf f$, $f(x) > \alpha$

$\Rightarrow \exists \beta > \inf f$, $\exists N' \subseteq N(x_0)$ such that $f(x) > \beta \quad \forall x \in N'$

2. Saddle point: $f: X \times Z \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$

$(\bar{x}, \bar{z}) \in X \times Z$ is a saddle point of f if

$$f(\bar{x}, \bar{z}) \leq f(x, \bar{z}) \quad \forall (x, \bar{z}) \in X \times Z$$

Von Neumann Thm: If f is continuous convex-concave, and X, Z are non-empty compact convex, then f has a saddle point.

(VR): $A = B = X \times Z$

$$S(x, z) = X \times Z = T_1(x, z)$$

No C, No T_2 .

$$R((x_1, z_1), (x_1', z_1')) \text{ holds } \Leftrightarrow f(x_1, z_1) \leq f(x_1', z_1)$$

(FS): $(x_1, z_1), \dots, (x_n, z_n) \in X \times Z$.

$\exists x_0 \in X, z_0 \in Z$ such that

$$f(x_0, z_0) \leq f(x_i, z_i) \quad \forall i.$$

(CFS) is true if f is quasiconvex in x
quasiconcave in x .

(IC) $\Leftrightarrow (x, z) \mapsto f(x, z) \in X \times Z : f(x, z) - f(x', z') \leq 0$
is (IC).

Parametric VR!

Let Λ be a topological (parameter) space.

I. Model:

Corresponding to a fixed $\lambda \in \Lambda$, we have (VR) as

(CVR) $^\lambda$: Find $\bar{a} \in A^\lambda$ such that

- $\bar{a} \in S^\lambda(\bar{a})$
- $R^\lambda(\bar{a}, b, c)$ holds $\forall b \in T_1^\lambda(\bar{a})$
 $\forall c \in T_2^\lambda(\bar{a}, b)$

where $S^\lambda : A^\lambda \rightrightarrows A^\lambda$

$T_1^\lambda : A^\lambda \rightrightarrows B^\lambda$

$T_2^\lambda : A^\lambda \times B^\lambda \rightrightarrows C^\lambda$

R^λ is a relation on $A^\lambda \times B^\lambda \times C^\lambda$.

Let Σ^λ be the solution set of (CVR) $^\lambda$.

Let $A^\lambda, B^\lambda, C^\lambda, S^\lambda, T_1^\lambda, T_2^\lambda$ be fixed.

II. Continuity of set-valued maps!

$F : \Lambda \rightrightarrows X$

(i) Superior / outer limit:

$\limsup_{\lambda \rightarrow \lambda_0} F(\lambda) = \{x \in X : \exists \lambda_k \xrightarrow{\neq} \lambda_0, x_k \in F(\lambda_k) \rightarrow x\}$
 $\lambda \neq \lambda_0$

(ii) Inferior / inner limit:

$\liminf_{\lambda \rightarrow \lambda_0} F(\lambda) = \{x \in X : \forall \lambda_k \xrightarrow{\neq} \lambda_0, \exists x_k \in F(\lambda_k) \rightarrow x\}$
 $\lambda \rightarrow \lambda_0$

(ii) ~~(i)~~ F is closed if its graph is closed in $\Lambda \times X$.

(i) F is outer-continuous at λ_0 if

$$\lim_{\lambda \rightarrow \lambda_0} \sup_{\neq} F(\lambda) \subseteq F(\lambda_0)$$

(ii) F is inner-continuous (lsc) at λ_0 if

$$\lim_{\lambda \rightarrow \lambda_0} \inf_{\neq} F(\lambda) \supseteq F(\lambda_0)$$

(i) F is usc at λ_0 if \forall open set $V \ni F(\lambda_0)$, \exists open set $U \ni \lambda_0$ such that

$$F(\lambda) \subseteq V \quad \forall \lambda \in U.$$

Properties: $F, G: \Lambda \rightarrow X$

1. F and G are outer-continuous $\Rightarrow F \cap G$ is also outer-continuous.

$$(C(F \cap G))(A) = F(A) \cap G(A).$$

2. F and G are inner-continuous $\nRightarrow F \cup G$ is inner-continuous.

New concepts:

(i) Superior open limit:

$$\lim_{\lambda \rightarrow \lambda_0} \sup_{\neq} F(\lambda) = \{x \in X : \exists \lambda_k \xrightarrow{\neq} \lambda_0, \exists V \ni x \text{ such that } V \subseteq F(\lambda_k)\}.$$

(ii) Inferior open limit:

$$\lim_{\lambda \rightarrow \lambda_0} \inf_{\neq} F(\lambda) = \{x \in X : \exists U \ni \lambda_0, \exists V \ni x \text{ such that } V \subseteq F(\lambda) \quad \forall \lambda \in U\}.$$

(iii) F is outer-open if $\limsup_{\neq} F(\lambda) \subseteq F(\lambda_0)$.

(iv) F is inner-open if $\liminf_{\neq} F(\lambda) \supseteq F(\lambda_0)$.

(iii) and (iv) are specifically for maps.
Single-valued functions are neither outer-open nor inner-open.

Properties:

1. F is inner open $\Leftrightarrow F^c$ is outer-continuous.
($F^c(A) = X \setminus F(A)$)

2. F is outer-open $\Leftrightarrow F^c$ is inner-continuous.

3. F is inner-open $\Rightarrow F$ is inner-continuous.

1. F is inner-open } \Rightarrow $F \circ G$ is inner-continuous.
2. G is inner-continuous }

II. Stability of Σ^1 :

A : non-empty compact $R^1: A \in A$.

$S: A \xrightarrow{\sim} A$

$T_1: A \xrightarrow{\sim} B$

$T_2: A \times B \xrightarrow{\sim} C$

Thm: Σ^1 is outer-continuous at λ_0 under the following conditions:

(i) $S(\cdot)$ is closed.

(ii) $T_1, C(\cdot)$ is inner-continuous.

(iii) $T_2(\cdot, \cdot)$ is inner-continuous.

(iv) $R^1(\cdot, \cdot)$ is closed at λ_0 .

($A_k \xrightarrow{\sim} \lambda_0$, $a_k \in S(A_k) \xrightarrow{\sim} a$

$b_k \in T_1(A_k) \xrightarrow{\sim} b$

$c_k \in T_2(A_k, b_k) \xrightarrow{\sim} c$

$R^k(c_k, b_k, a_k)$ holds $\Rightarrow R^{\lambda_0}(a, b, c)$ holds.)

P1: To prove! $\lambda_k \rightarrow \lambda_0$ $\Rightarrow a \in \Sigma^{\lambda_0}$.
 $a_k \in \Sigma^{\lambda_k} \rightarrow a$

- $a_k \in S(a_k) \Rightarrow$ by (i), $a \in S(a)$
- $b \in T_1(a)$, $c \in T_2(a, b) \Rightarrow b_k \in T_1(a_k) \rightarrow b$
 $c_k \in T_2(a_k, b_k) \rightarrow c$.
- $R^{\lambda_k}(a_k, b_k, c_k)$ holds \Rightarrow by (iv), $R^{\lambda_0}(a, b, c)$ holds.
 $\Rightarrow a \in \Sigma^{\lambda_0}$.

Thm 2: Σ^{λ} is inner continuous at λ_0 if

- (i) $S(\cdot)$ is inner open.
- (ii) $T_1(\cdot)$ has compact values.
- (iii) $T_2(a, \cdot)$ is closed $\forall a \in A$.
- (iv) $R^{\lambda_0}(a, b, c)$ does not hold whenever $R^{\lambda_k}(a_k, b_k, c_k)$ does not hold
 for some $b_k \in T_1(a_k)$, $c_k \in T_2(a_k, b_k)$
 with $b_k \rightarrow b$, $c_k \rightarrow c$.

IV. Application:

Parametric Equilibrium Problem:

$$X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^n, \phi_{\lambda}: X \times X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}, \lambda \in \Lambda$$

(VI)¹: Find $\bar{x} \in X$ such that

$$\phi_{\lambda}(\bar{x}, y) \geq 0 \quad \forall y \in X.$$

$$(VR)¹: A = B = C = X$$

$$S(a) = X = T_1(a)$$

$$T_2(x, y) = \{y\}$$

$$R^{\lambda}(x, y) \text{ holds} \Leftrightarrow \phi_{\lambda}(x, y) \geq 0.$$